

Executive

13 January 2022

Report of the Director of Housing, Economy and Regeneration and the Director of Environment, Planning and Transport

Portfolio of the Executive Member of Housing and Safer Neighbourhoods and the Executive Member of Transport

The Groves - The Future of the Low Traffic Neighbourhood Trial

Summary

1. The Executive Member for Transport approved the implementation of an 18 month Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (“ETRO”) in The Groves in June 2020 (plan Annex A1). This 18 month Low Traffic Neighbourhood trial period is coming to an end and a decision is required as to whether this is to become a permanent solution or whether the roads are to be re-opened to through traffic.
2. The ETRO was established following significant feedback from residents of The Groves as part of public engagement into the development of a new community plan and addressed their concerns about the impact of through traffic on their residential neighbourhood.
3. This report sets out the results of both community and statutory consultations, alongside the assessment of the impacts of the ETRO with a view to making a permanent decision about the Low Traffic Neighbourhood and the agreement of any associated TRO as well as recommending the Groves Community Plan for adoption/agreement.

Recommendations

4. It is recommended that Executive:
 - I. Approve making the ETRO permanent with the changes to the scheme as set out in the report

- changing the closure points to use bollards and signage improvements in and around The Groves
- making permanent the changes that were made to a small number of parking spaces, which were removed or relocated to make room for turning points at the closures, and merging the existing resident parking zones permanently.

Reason: To provide quality alternative sustainable modes of transport in order to encourage behavioural change and maximise the use of walking, cycling and public transport and continue improving road safety; minimise the emission of harmful pollutants and traffic danger within the Groves; enhance public streets and spaces to improve the quality of life; minimise the impact of motorised traffic and encourage economic, social and cultural activity.

- II. Ask officers to continue to monitor and review the impacts of the scheme and (as part of LTP4), consider further mitigations to be identified where required.

Reason: In line with Transport objectives, both existing LTP3 objectives and emerging LTP4 objectives and as is normal practice for newly established Low Traffic Neighbourhood schemes.

- III. Delegate sign off of detailed design for the permanent closure points (bollard type and exact locations), and any further small changes to parking, signing and lining required to make the arrangements permanent to the Director of Environment, Planning and Transport in consultation with the Executive Member for Transport.

Reason: To enable the closure points to be designed for the permanent scheme, with adequate signage for highway users within and around the Groves.

- IV. To note the Groves Community Plan as the outcomes of the community consultation and ask officers to explore options and opportunities for external funding to bring forward objectives identified in the plan.

Reason: to improve the Groves area and deliver the benefits identified by the Groves Community Plan.

Background

The Groves

5. The Groves is a residential area which has long experienced the impact of large volumes of through traffic. This is evidenced by the incremental build-up of traffic restrictions and measures aimed at controlling through traffic, for example:
 - I. One way streets (early 1970s);
 - II. Access only orders (1970s);
 - III. 7.5t weight restriction order (1970s);
 - IV. Extensive use of waiting restrictions (1970s, 80s, 90s);
 - V. Minor road closures (1980s);
 - VI. Residents parking (1980s and 90s); and
 - VII. Traffic calming and 20mph speed limit (1990s).
6. Community engagement with residents of The Groves has been taking place for three years and there is significant community support for change in the area. This work has led to the development of The Groves Community Plan which aims to create a more sociable neighbourhood, improving the health and wellbeing of residents by considering both physical interventions and appropriate support and guidance in the facilitation of community activity. The plan explores the potential for new affordable housing, improved streets and public spaces, and local projects to involve residents. The most significant and most common concern raised by residents was that The Groves is used as a through route for cars. Residents stated how this brings noise, pollution, and adds physical barriers between neighbours as well reduces sustainable access to local facilities and services within the area.
7. York's existing Local Transport Plan aims to improve strategic transport links in order to enhance the connections between key residential and employment areas in and around York, and beyond, encourage behavioural change to maximise the use of walking, cycling and public transport, tackle transport emissions to reduce the release of pollutants harmful to health and the environment, and enhance public streets and spaces to improve the quality of life, minimise the

impact of motorised traffic and encourage economic, social and cultural activity.

8. This approach was supported by Executive in September 2021 when the decision was made to support the submission of a planning application for the York Outer Ring Road (YORR) Phase 1 dualling scheme. The report noted: *“in principle, it is anticipated that traffic will redistribute around the city as a result of the additional orbital capacity, reducing overall journey times and emissions. Further measures, enabled by this additional capacity, are being considered as part of the development of the new Local Transport Plan to reduce the impact of traffic within the city’s urban areas”*. As part of the development of the next Local Transport Plan, additional Low Traffic Neighbourhoods may therefore be identified.
9. In October 2019, the Executive Member for Transport approved the principle of a Low Traffic Neighbourhood (“LTN”) in The Groves. Further design work took place following this decision, and residents and local businesses were consulted about trialling a number of road closure points and changes to traffic routes in February 2020.
10. The Executive Member for Transport then approved the revised proposals for the implementation of an 18 month Experimental Traffic Regulation Order (“ETRO”) in The Groves in June 2020.
11. The closures and traffic changes started on 2 September 2020, with closure points set up in five locations: the junction of Lowther Street and Brownlow Street, St John's Crescent, Penley's Grove Street, Neville Terrace, and Earle Street. These closure points prevent vehicles passing through, but are open to pedestrians and cyclists. In addition, the existing closure point at Neville Terrace was removed, Brownlow Street and March Street became one-way streets, except for cyclists, and Penley's Grove Street became two-way, to allow traffic to exit onto Monkgate.
12. Following further feedback and as permitted under the regulations for experimental orders, adjustments were made to the trial in November 2020, including changing the position of the road closures on St. John's Crescent and at the junction between Neville Terrace, Park

Grove and Brownlow Street, and making some small changes to on street parking in the area.

13. The 18 month trial period is now coming to an end and a decision is required as to whether the low traffic neighbourhood trial is to become permanent or whether the roads are to be re-opened to through traffic.

The Groves Community Plan

14. The Groves was selected for the development of a housing led Community Plan as it compares very poorly with other areas of York against a number of health and wellbeing indices.
15. The Community Plan aims to create a more sociable neighbourhood, improving the health and wellbeing of residents by considering both physical interventions and appropriate support and guidance in the facilitation of community activity. The Community Plan explores the potential for new affordable housing, improved streets and public spaces, and local projects to involve residents.
16. Prior to the LTN consultation and proposal, there had been a great deal of engagement with residents in order to develop a Community Plan for the Groves. Feedback from residents at the many workshops, walkabouts and local event sessions has been very positive and ambitious. Residents describe the well-defined sense of community and potential for community connections to develop further. However, alongside the many positive comments, there have been strong and repeated calls to address the traffic and air quality issues in the area.
17. Investment in community-led regeneration addresses some of the key things we are learning from the Coronavirus outbreak – the importance of community, mental and physical health, wellbeing, access to usable and safe outdoor space, local gardening and other communal projects. Reducing through traffic can be a key catalyst in supporting this work.
18. Government grant funding has been used to support a number of local community projects in the Groves and across the city. These aim to

address isolation, loneliness, health and well-being through community planting/ growing, activity sessions and confidence building.

19. Funds have been awarded to:-
 - a. Move the Masses' physical activity programme;
 - b. Flower Power's community grow project;
 - c. Bright Sparks' early intervention to provide help and support to parents who are struggling;
 - d. The Groves Association's community planting, secret garden and arts/ heritage projects;
20. These projects have been very successful, with, for example, the Secret Garden revitalised and rejuvenated, resident volunteers have planted flowers in underused spaces throughout The Groves. Flower arranging and cookery workshops aimed at addressing loneliness, isolation and healthy eating have also taken place. Weekly gardening sessions, cooking on a budget workshops, creative café, natter group, summer fair and Halloween disco, curry nights and free activity sessions through Move The Masses have all been popular. A number of other projects and initiatives (e.g. local story telling, public art and walking trails) in association with the Groves Association and local residents are planned.
21. Residents and local artists have been interviewing residents, old and new, to develop walking trails which highlight resident reflections on the history of the Groves. The trails complement the LTN experiment and the wider aims to provide more sociable spaces for residents and more opportunities to walk safely, socialise and help to green the Groves.
22. The ambitions of the community have been captured in the Groves Community Plan which is attached at Annex A2. The vision of the plan is to facilitate estate renewal in housing and the local environment, while making a positive and lasting difference to the lives of residents. Five key themes (Health and Well-being, Green Spaces, Movement Network, Housing, and Community Hub) have been the subject of discussions and the outcome of these is set out in the Community Plan.
23. This plan sets out a number of long term community led opportunities for change alongside council or partner led capital investments to

improve the physical environment and provide new homes. Further work is needed to assess how to deliver some of these ambitions and Executive are asked to agree further work to develop fundable propositions from this plan and to explore suitable external funding sources to deliver future improvements.

24. It is considered that the ambitions outlined in the Community Plan would be negatively impacted by the re-opening of through traffic into the narrow residential streets of The Groves.
25. The Community plan is currently in draft format and will be finalised and agreed in the coming calendar year.

Low Traffic Neighbourhoods (LTNs)

26. Planning and transport policies seek to enable more trips to be undertaken by sustainable means, encourage behavioural change to maximise the use of walking, cycling and public transport and continue to improve road safety, tackle transport emissions, and enhance public streets and spaces to improve the quality of life, minimise the impact of motorised traffic and encourage economic, social and cultural activity.
27. Nationally, this policy direction has been reflected and encouraged by the DfT, who include the decarbonisation of transport, improving air quality and providing quality, sustainable transport alternatives as priority outcomes in the recently published DfT Outcome Delivery Plan: 2021 to 2022.
28. There are examples of LTNs all over the country, notably in Hackney and Waltham Forest, which have the highest number of LTNs by area in London. As a comparator for York, Bath and North East Somerset also have a strategy for LTNs.
29. The LTN trial has tested the principle of reducing the impact of traffic within urban residential areas of the city, through a shift towards sustainable transport alongside directing car journeys onto key arterial routes and the inner and outer ring roads. It is generally accepted that in order to achieve a reduction of traffic impacts within residential urban areas, traffic flow has to be restricted. As shown in this report, this has impacts on other routes within the city.
30. This report presents the results of the LTN trial's monitoring and evaluation as well as the formal objections to the ETRO made during the trial, now that the measures have been in place unchanged for at

least 6 months (the minimum period before the measures can be considered for making the ETRO permanent).

31. Data collated for the trial identifies the following key impacts and changes, described in more detail in the Executive Summary of the transport implications at Annex A3 with the full WSP report and data available online as background papers:
- **Impact on motorised traffic in The Groves** – Significant reduction in motorised traffic in The Groves in general, with a smaller reduction on St John Street and St John’s Crescent, and with the exception of a modest increase in traffic volumes on Park Grove. For drivers within The Groves wanting to reach a destination on the other side of the closures, journey times by car have increased due to the trial;
 - **Impact on motorised traffic around The Groves** – Increases in traffic on surrounding roads including Lord Mayor’s Walk, Clarence Street, Haxby Road, Monkgate, Huntington Road, Haley’s Terrace and Dodsworth Avenue. The most significant increases in journey times are located on the Gillygate/ Clarence Street corridor and on Lord Mayor’s Walk. This may not be due entirely to the trial as there is a gating scheme to control access to Gillygate at the junction and journey times have increased over the same period in other parts of the City;
 - **Impact on journey times for drivers who used to travel through The Groves** - Increase in journey time estimated between 1 and 8 minutes with the trial in place as a result of having to use alternative routes; or ‘main roads’
 - **Impact on bus services** - journey times seem to have increased by between 30 and 90 seconds in the northbound direction for bus service 5, which travels on Clarence Street and Haxby Road, and by between 50 and 90 seconds in the northbound direction for bus service 6 which travels on Wigginton Road;
 - **Impact on cycling** - Traffic data generally shows increases in the number of cyclists travelling through the area. This is generally valid for streets in The Groves, with the exception of Lowther Street at the junction with Haxby Road and St John Street, where the data seems to indicate very small reductions in cycling. More significant increases in cycling were noted in streets around The Groves, between 21% and 29% growth
 - **Impact on air quality** – Data collated by the Council in The Groves and the surrounding area shows a general reduction in

annual mean NO₂ concentrations. It is however important to note that widespread improvements in air quality were observed in York in 2020 compared with previous years, primarily due to a reduction in emissions from vehicles linked to the Covid 19 pandemic. Whilst this could be regarded as atypical, this is in line with the general downward trend in NO₂ concentrations monitored across the city since 2012.

Dispersion model predictions (this models displacement onto the rest of the network, but doesn't account for changes in travel behaviour) show that the changes in traffic flows between 2020 (before the trial) to 2021 (during the trial) are likely to cause local air quality deterioration for residential and educational receptors located north and south of the scheme, along Haxby Road. However, local air quality improvements are expected for residential and educational receptors located on Lowther Street and Townend Street.

The highest adverse impact in NO₂ concentration (+0.3µg/m³ or a 3.3% increase) is predicted at Haxby Road Primary Academy, in which future mitigation will be considered, and the highest beneficial impact (-1.9µg/m³ or a 11.9% reduction) at Park Grove Primary Academy.

Consultation responses and objections

32. Under an ETRO, the consultation is carried out for a maximum period of 18 months with the measures in place, so that residents, businesses and road users can experience the proposals first hand and make a well informed representation either against or in support of the scheme. This differs from the more usual method for a permanent Traffic Regulation Order proposal where the consultation is carried out for a minimum of 3 weeks, seeking views on the proposals and the objections are considered before the proposed scheme can, if approved, be implemented.

Overview of representations received

33. Representations were initially received from the emergency services after early scheme changes had been made and since then have

confirmed in December 2021 that these represent their current views. They are as follows:

- Yorkshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust (25 February 2021): *“I have spoken to my clinical supervisor team and they don’t feel that there is a big issue. Locality Manager – York Station and UCP/ECP team Sherburn.*
- Fire Service (29 January 2021): *“I’m the person who initially voiced my concern over the necessity of using St John Street to access Fern Lockwood and Waverly Streets. I’m pleased to see that the blockage on St John’s Crescent is passable by use of access codes. This will give us a much quicker response time to any persons reported incidents within that proximity.*
. Watch Manager - York Fire Station
- North Yorkshire Police (21 January 2021): *“I have consulted with our Operational staff and there have been no issues around the closure to through traffic of the Groves”.* Traffic Management Dept.

Statutory consultation responses and objections

34. During the first consultation on the ETRO between September 2020 and May 2021 there were 261 representations made. The representations can be summarised into:
- 139 in objection;
 - 87 in support; and
 - 35 making requests, comments, information and questions.
35. Following the revision of the ETRO in November 2020 additional representations were received (May '21 onwards). These were:
- 62 in objection
 - 29 in support.
 - 28 making requests, comments, information and questions.

The most frequent objections to the experiment are:

- Delays on alternative routes, additional length of alternative routes
- Access difficulties due to queuing traffic; increased noise and pollution from traffic; frustration at increased complexity of previous simple trips

- Movement difficulties due to conflicting traffic; safety concerns from queuing traffic; increased noise and pollution from traffic; and
- Access difficulties due to queuing traffic; frustration at increased complexity of previous simple trips; being on 'the wrong side of the divide' for local trips; public safety concerns from change in evening activity patterns.

The reasons for support are:

- Increased feeling of safety
- Reduced noise pollution
- Reduced air pollution
- Less traffic – better for pedestrians
- Has delivered benefits for cyclists
- Improved accessibility for wheelchair users
- A positive difference to quality of life; and
- There is increased community spirit.

36. Based on this data and consultation feedback, planned works of relevance to the trial and a number of proposed improvement works are presented in the report to help address some of the issues raised. These range from upgrades to junctions, cycling improvements, as well further surveys and monitoring of impacts on surrounding residential streets to consider further mitigations in the future.
37. Due to the scale of this scheme and the large number of representations made during the experiment, the full text of the individual objections in the annexes have been distilled into a number of bullet points for the reasons for objection (see Annexes B and D with retail objections at Annex E). The number of times these views have been expressed in the objections has been noted alongside the bullet points to enable a rapid appreciation of the most common themes for objecting to the scheme.
38. Although not required by the legal process, in the run up to the experiment being in place unchanged for 6 months a letter was issued to residents in the Groves area to advise that the ETRO objections were due to be considered with a possibility of them being made permanent. This was done to encourage anyone interested in the experiment to make any new comments they wished to make in order for them to be included in the report for consideration. Comments

made after this request are show, again in bullet point form (201 to 262), in Annex D.

39. The most frequent objections to the experiment are (from Annexes B, C and D) as follows:

Table 1: Summary of most frequent objections

Objector - key aspect	Main points with officer comment
From those travelling through this sector of York	Delays on alternative routes, additional length of alternative routes – see ‘Impact’ sections above
From those living in the surrounding streets in this sector of York – car users	Access difficulties due to queuing traffic; increased noise and pollution from traffic; frustration at increased complexity of previous simple trips – see detail descriptions and Air and Noise sections above
From those living in the surrounding streets in this sector of York – pedestrians, cyclists or bus users	Movement difficulties due to conflicting traffic; safety concerns from queuing traffic; increased noise and pollution from traffic – see ‘Impact’ sections; detail descriptions and Air and Noise sections above
From those living within the Groves	Access difficulties due to queuing traffic; frustration at increased complexity of previous simple trips; being on ‘the wrong side of the divide’ for local trips; public safety concerns from change in evening activity patterns – see ‘Impact’ sections above
From those with businesses within the Groves	Reduced trade potential from lower levels of passing traffic; access difficulties due to queuing traffic; frustration at increased complexity of previous simple service trips – see ‘Impact’ sections above

40. Whilst the formal consultation process for traffic regulation orders is for the consideration of objections to a scheme, it should be noted that there have also been 87 representations made in support of the measures when they were put in place with a further 29 since May 2021. The reasons for support are highlighted in bullet point form in Annex F and the main reasons for support are indicated below:

- Increased feeling of safety;
- Reduced noise pollution;

- Reduced air pollution;
- Less traffic – better for pedestrians;
- Has delivered benefits for cyclists;
- Improved accessibility for wheelchair users;
- A positive difference to quality of life; and
- There is increased community spirit.

41. Not all those making representation provided address details. However, Table 2 provides an indication of where the representations against and in support of the experiment originated from in terms of whether from within or outside The Groves.

Table 2: Likely origin of the representations (based on all iterations of the experiment)

Position expressed in the representation	Within the Groves area	From outside the Groves area	Unknown
Support	70.7%	17.2%	12.1%
Objections	23.4%	56.7%	21.9%

42. In addition, there have been two e-petitions received that relate to this experiment, one for and one against the measures introduced through the trial. The e-petition opposed to the experiment has received 2,084 signatures (1 October 2020). Also received was a petition asking for more room to walk and cycle in York, with the group which started the petition (York Cycle Campaign) linking these demands to the experimental scheme in The Groves. The petition has received 3,905 signatures (as of 2 October 2020).

Online survey

43. An online survey was made available between 18 October and 14 November 2021, open to all wanting to share their views on the trial. For those who were not able or did not want to take part in the online survey, email and postal addresses were available as well for representations to be made directly to the Council.
44. The online questionnaire received 1,514 responses. This represents an excellent response rate and demonstrates the high level of interest in the trial. The detail of the survey methodology and analysis of the

responses received can be found in the background papers to the report.

45. Table 3: Summary of responses to: “On a scale of 1-10, to what extent do you support the Low Traffic Neighbourhood trial in The Groves?”

Views expressed	From within the Groves	From outside the Groves
Broadly positive (6 to 10)	221 respondents	159 respondents
Broadly negative (1 to 5)	182 respondents	758 respondents

46. Key points to summarise the views expressed through the online survey include:
- a. 73% of respondents indicated that they oppose the trial and 27% of respondents stated that they support the trial. Support for the trial was stronger amongst residents of The Groves but some Groves residents oppose the trial and some respondents who reside outside The Groves support the trial
 - b. The main reasons stated for opposing the trial were: causes congestion / slow traffic, doesn't reduce traffic / forces it elsewhere, causes more air pollution due to congestion, longer journey times now, negative effect on surrounding roads, need to drive further now / direct routes cut off, and delays emergency services / longer journeys for police, ambulance, fire
 - c. The main reasons stated for supporting the trial were: reduced pollution / improved air quality - positive impact on health, quality of life has improved as a result of the LTN, and reduced noise levels
 - d. When asked to identify what actions they had taken as a result of the implementation of The Groves LTN, 46% of drivers who responded to the survey said that they found an alternative route, and 12% said that they had cancelled some of their journeys. Some drivers indicated that they were more likely to walk or cycle instead of driving and some said that they had reduced the number of car journeys they make
 - e. The experience of walking in The Groves improved with the trial, with some people stating that they now walk more frequently in The Groves

- f. The experience of cycling in The Groves improved with the trial, with some people stating that they now cycle more frequently in The Groves.
47. The discussions with local organisations brought together a range of views and these are summarised in the background documents.

Planned and proposed improvements/mitigations

48. As shown above, the LTN trial in The Groves has resulted in a significant reduction in motorised traffic through most streets in The Groves. This has also resulted in significant increases in traffic for some surrounding streets due to drivers rerouting their journeys.
49. Some improvements are already planned on some of the routes where traffic has been redirected, as follows:
- Huntington Road/ Haley's Terrace/ Fossway junction - As part of the Council's Smart Transport programmes (TSAR / STEP), the signalised junction at Huntington Road / Haley's Terrace has now had communications installed and the Council is in the process of upgrading the traffic signal controller to gain Urban Traffic Control (UTC) functionality. The work should be completed by March 2022, allowing the Council to implement traffic signal timing plans at the junction, to better manage traffic, and improved fault monitoring;
 - Dodsworth Avenue/ Mill Lane/ Heworth Green – The controller currently in place for this signalised pedestrian crossing on Heworth Green, near the junction with Dodsworth Avenue, has been failing regularly since June 2021. As the controller is not connected to the Council's communication network, this has to be reported once identified by an inspector or a member of the public, resulting in poor response times and traffic impacts. The Council proposes to refurbish all on site signal equipment through the TSAR programme. As above, this work will improve the performance of the signalised crossing, reducing faults and response time.
50. Additionally, if the trial is to become permanent, the following measures will be considered, through the Local Transport Plan process, to address known issues on the road network where additional traffic is being redirected due to the closures in The Groves:
- Monkgate/ Foss Bank/ Heworth Green/ Huntington Road junction – Junction improvements to address pedestrian and

cycling safety issues. Feasibility and design to be progressed through the Local Transport Plan (LTP) and Local Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plan (LCWIP);

- Consideration of the option to create an inbound bus lane on Clarence Street and its impacts as part of the City Centre Bus Study, taking changes in The Groves into account;
- Haley's Terrace/ Fossway/ Dodsworth Avenue – Additional data gathering and monitoring for this corridor to inform an improvement plan (if required).

51. If the decision is taken to make the changes permanent, improvements to the closure points will be required to remove the unsightly concrete blocks and install suitably designed bollards, considering the needs of users of adapted cycles and mobility aids. These do not need to be rated for hostile vehicle mitigation as they do not fulfil such a function in this area. Signage improvements within The Groves and at the periphery will also be required to clearly identify routes and restrictions in place for motorised vehicles and routes for pedestrians and cyclists, including access to shops and businesses in The Groves.
52. Some limited changes to on street parking arrangements will also be required to cater for the closure becoming permanent. This is likely to include making permanent the changes that were made to a small number of parking spaces, which were removed or relocated to make room for turning points at the closures, and merging the existing resident parking zones permanently.
53. Additionally, if the trial was to become permanent, the Council should continue to monitor the scheme's impact on The Groves and the surrounding streets to understand the long term impacts of the Low Traffic Neighbourhood scheme and identify any future mitigations or responses to any unintended consequences. This would also enable the scheme to be reviewed in light of emerging legislation (for example considering the Government's proposed changes to the enforcement of moving traffic offences and opportunities that this change may present in terms of ANPR camera enforcement).

Options for Consideration

54. The following options have been identified for Executive to consider.
55. **Option 1 - Conclude the experiment and return the road network to how it used to be.** This is not a recommended option because it would not meet the Transport objectives, as stated in the current Local

Transport Plan and would not meet the Housing objectives expressed in the Community Plan.

56. **Option 2 – Conclude the experiment** and return the road network to how it used to be on a temporary basis **whilst an alternative scheme to meet regeneration and transport objectives is developed and implemented**. This is not a recommended option because it would not meet the Transport objectives as stated in the current Local Transport Plan and would not meet the Housing objectives expressed in the Community Plan in the short to medium term whilst an alternative scheme is developed. Developing an alternative scheme would be likely to take further time and therefore, cost. It would also undermine the benefits of removing through traffic from residential areas.
57. **Option 3 - Approve making the ETRO permanent with small changes to the scheme and parking within The Groves as required for permanent arrangements**. A capital allocation is required between £50k and £80k to make the scheme permanent. This is the **recommended option** because it meets the Transport and Housing objectives outlined in the Council Plan, LTP3 and the emerging LTP4, national policy direction from the DfT and previously agreed resolutions of Full Council. It also enables the current closures to be replaced by more suitable bollards (which can be removed to provide access to emergency services) and allows for further mitigation measures identified in this report to be implemented as planned or through the Local Transport Plan process. This option will also allow for further data to be collected as measures are made permanent, keep the scheme under review with regard to long term impacts and possible further mitigations.
58. **Option 4 - Approve making the ETRO permanent with small changes to the scheme and parking in The Groves as required for permanent arrangements, with the exception of the closure of St John Street and St John's Crescent**. This is not the recommended option because reopening this area of The Groves to through traffic would risk creating another cut-through route between Lord Mayor's

Walk and Monkgate, resulting in road safety issues for drivers, cyclists and pedestrians.

Analysis

59. This section presents an appraisal of the advantages and disadvantages of each of the options presented above.
60. The transport objectives considered to assess the options are those stated in the current Local Transport Plan:
 - Providing quality alternative sustainable modes of transport to provide more choice and enable more trips to be undertaken by sustainable means;
 - Encouraging behavioural change to maximise the use of walking, cycling and public transport and continue improving road safety;
 - Tackling transport emissions to reduce the release of pollutants harmful to health and the environment; and
 - Enhancing public streets and spaces to improve the quality of life, minimise the impact of motorised traffic and encourage economic, social and cultural activity.
61. The housing objectives considered alongside the Community Plan to assess the options include:
 - Better air quality;
 - Less and slower traffic; and
 - The chance to build on the existing sense of community.

Table 4: Option assessment

Option	Advantages	Drawbacks
<p>Option 1 – Conclude the experiment and return the road network to how it used to be</p>	<p>Through route reopen to traffic – journey times to destinations near the Groves should return to pre-trial levels (although other factors may influence journey times)</p> <p>No further investment required apart for the removal of the trial equipment, signage and lining</p>	<p>Transport objectives not met (as stated in the Local Transport Plan, i.e. encouraging behavioural change to maximise the use of walking, cycling and public transport and continue improving road safety; enhancing public streets and spaces to improve the quality of life, minimise the impact of motorised traffic and encourage economic, social and cultural activity)</p> <p>Housing objectives not met (as expressed in the Community Plan, i.e. removal of the high levels of through traffic from The Groves, improve road safety and air quality, create the conditions for a healthier and more active community in the area)</p>
<p>Option 2 - Conclude the experiment and implement an alternative scheme</p>	<p>Through route reopen to traffic whilst new scheme is being developed – journey times to destinations near the Groves should return to pre-trial levels (although other factors may influence journey times)</p> <p>Transport and housing objectives considered again to develop a new scheme</p>	<p>Transport and housing objectives (as listed above) not met in the short to medium term – delay in implementation</p> <p>Uncertainty on any other scheme being viable</p>

Option	Advantages	Drawbacks
	Planned changes to legislation could enable ANPR enforcement of restrictions in the future	Further cost associated with the development and testing of an alternative scheme.
Option 3 - ETRO becomes permanent with small changes to the final scheme	Transport and housing objectives (as listed above) met	<p>Some increase in traffic in surrounding streets</p> <p>Some increase in journey time for some drivers accessing destinations in or near The Groves at peak times.</p>
Option 4 - ETRO becomes permanent with small changes to the final scheme, with the exception of the closure of St John Street and St John's Crescent which is removed	<p>Transport and housing objectives (as listed above) mostly met</p> <p>Although St John Street has benefited from a reduction in traffic, this reduction is of a much smaller scale than that identified for the rest of The Groves so reopening the street to through traffic would have limited impact on St John Street, whilst providing more flexibility for traffic accessing St John's Street, St John's Crescent, Fern Street, Lockwood Street and Waverley Street, especially at school drop off and pick up times when vehicles accessing Monk Bar car park can cause access issues for local residents.</p>	<p>As Option 3</p> <p>Reopening these streets whilst making the rest of the scheme permanent could lead to additional through traffic using them to cut through between Monkgate and Lord Mayor's Walk in the absence of another through route in The Groves, leading to road safety issues.</p> <p>Potential increases in traffic on St John's Crescent and Penley's Grove Street would be more significant (when compared to traffic levels during the trial).</p> <p>Note:</p> <p>Issues around school pick up and drop off times and vehicular access through St John</p>

Option	Advantages	Drawbacks
		Street onto Lord Mayor's walk can be addressed through ongoing dialogue with residents/the school and monitored as part of the implementation of the Groves Community plan

Council Plan

62. The proposals relate to the following outcomes, as set out in the Council Plan 2019-2023 (Making History, Building Communities):

- good health and wellbeing;
- getting around sustainably;
- a better start for children and young people;
- a greener and cleaner city;
- creating homes and world-class infrastructure; and
- safe communities and culture for all.

Implications

63. The following implications have been identified:

• Financial

Costs of the experimental stage of the LTN: approx. £90,000, including:

- £35,000 in design fees;
- £4,000 in signage costs;
- £17,000 in highway works;
- £2,500 in TRO advertising costs and communications;
- £10,000 in traffic barriers and planters; and
- £21,500 in monitoring and evaluation costs.

Estimated costs to remove the LTN and go back to previous arrangements (Option 1): £20,000

Estimated costs to make the measures permanent (Option 3): £50,000- to £80,000

There is £50k set aside in the Local Transport Plan for development of the Groves Low Traffic Neighbourhood Scheme. To date approximately half the budget has been spent

The recommended option of making the scheme permanent is anticipated to cost approximately £50k-£80k. Some of these costs can be covered by the remaining 2021/22 Local Transport Plan allocation. However there will need to be an additional allocation of budget for 2022/23 likely to be c£50k. The Executive Member for Transport approves the schemes that will be included in the 2022/23 programme in a report to his

Decision Session and this scheme will be included in that report.

- **Human Resources (HR)**

There are no human resource implications identified

- **Equalities & Human Rights**

A comprehensive Equality Impact Assessment has been undertaken based on the outcome of the consultation to date. This is attached Annex G. Consideration has been given to the potential for any adverse equality impacts on people with 'protected characteristics', arising from the recommendation. The following convention rights of the Human Rights Act 1998 need to be considered when taking the decision:

Article 1 of the First Protocol Convention provides that every natural or legal person is entitled to the peaceful enjoyment of his possessions.

Article 2 of the Human Rights Convention is an unqualified right to life and to positive protection of that right by public authorities.

Article 8 of the Convention provides that "everyone has the right to respect for his private and family life and his home". Any decision relating to an experimental Traffic Regulation Order could interfere with Articles 1 and 8 rights for nearby residents, but the Council may interfere with such rights in accordance with the law as contained in the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 and, where it is necessary in a democratic society, in the interest of, amongst other things, public safety and/or the general interest. The decision-maker may consider and conclude that implementation of this Order is necessary in a democratic society to protect the environment and improve public safety.

- **Legal**

Legal implications are linked to the ETRO process, depending on the option selected

Officers consider that the proposal will enable the Council to carry out their duty under Section 122(1) of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984, which provides that it shall be the duty of every local authority upon whom functions are conferred by or under the 1984 Act so to exercise those functions as to secure expeditious, convenient and safe movement of vehicular and other traffic (including pedestrians) and the provision of suitable and adequate parking facilities on and off the highway.

The proposal will also enable the Council to carry out their network management duty under Section 16 of the Traffic Management Act 2004 to secure the expeditious movement of traffic on the authority's road network and both make more efficient use of their road network and the avoidance, elimination or reduction of road congestion or other disruption to the movement of traffic on their road network.

In the event that the decision maker resolves to approve the recommendation contained in this report, then to accord with the relevant statutory regulations, the Council will be required to make and advertise the Traffic Regulation Order concerned before it comes into operation. The Council will also be required to notify the objectors of its decision within 14 days of the Order being made.

Where an Order has been made (sealed), if any person wishes to question the validity of the Order or any of its provisions on the grounds that it or they are not within the powers conferred by the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984, or that any requirement of the 1984 Act or of any instrument made under the 1984 Act has not been complied with, they may apply to the High Court within 6 weeks from the date on which the Order is made.

- **Crime and Disorder**

There are no crime and disorder implications identified.

- **Information Technology (IT)**

There are IT implications identified

- **Property**

There are property implications identified

- **Other - Housing**

Risk Management

64. If the ETRO is not made permanent there is a risk that the benefits of the Groves Community plan are not realised and that traffic will once again dominate the primarily residential area. If the ETRO is

made permanent there is a risk of increased traffic and congestion on other primary routes as set out in the report.

Contact Details

Authors:

Helene Vergereau
Traffic and Highway
Development Manager

Michael Jones
Head of Housing
Delivery and Asset
Management

Chief Officers Responsible for the report:

James Gilchrist
Director of Transport, Environment and
Planning

Tracey Carter
Director Housing Economy and
Regeneration

Neil Ferris
Corporate Director of Place

Report Approved ✓
Date: 5 January 2022

Specialist Implications Officer(s)

Patrick Looker
Head of Finance

Heidi Lehane
Senior Solicitor

Wards Affected: Guildhall / All

For further information please contact the author of the report.

Annexes:

- Annex A1 The Groves ETRO Area (plan)
- Annex A2 Groves Community Plan
- Annex A3 Executive summary of transport analysis
- Annex B Objections to the ETRO (before November 2020 review)
- Annex C Objections to the ETRO (after November 2020 review)
- Annex D All Objections including after the reminder
- Annex E The local Spar objection
- Annex F All Support for the ETRO overall

Annex G Equality Impact Assessment

Background Papers (published online with the meeting agenda):

Road Safety Data

The Groves WSP Final Report

The Groves York Air Quality Technical Note